



Examining the Effectiveness of the Collaborative Teaching Approach in Fostering the Students' Humanistic Values at the Secondary Level in Pakistan

Dr. Afsar Sultana

Dow University of Health Sciences Karachi

Dr. Intizar Husain

Lecturer, Department of Teacher Education, University of Karachi, Karachi

Dr. Rafiqul Islam

School Education and literacy Department Sindh

Abstract

The research titled “Examining the Collaborative Approach to Teaching in Fostering Humanistic Values” explores how an individual’s scholastic methods contribute to the community and society as a whole, fostering values such as compassion, reverence, honesty, integrity, generosity, kindness, resilience, creativity, personal growth, and an appreciation for different viewpoints and experiences. The study is quantitative in nature and grounded in the positivist paradigm. Its design is structured and systematic, following a deductive approach. For data collection, the researcher used a closed-ended questionnaire (a 5-point Likert scale). The population for the study consisted of 350 teachers, selected as a cluster for data collection. The researcher made careful efforts to ensure the trustworthiness and credibility of the study, employing a numerical approach to ensure validity and reliability. The quantitative data was statistically analyzed using an independent samples t-test in SPSS version 20.0. Within the realm of inferential statistics, the independent samples t-test was used to analyze the data. Wrapping up the topic, the researcher examines how collaboration in teaching is a valuable method for nurturing humanistic values among learners. By encouraging compassion, reverence, honesty, integrity, generosity, and other values, educators can enhance not only students' intellectual knowledge but also their development as successful members of society. For successful outcomes, educators must carefully plan collaborative activities, facilitate effective group dynamics, and ensure that all student voices are heard and valued timely. It has been observed that a lack of collaborative teaching can create a significant divide and lead to negative consequences for students. The study offers valuable insights for policy planners, researchers, teachers, curriculum developers, and parents in Pakistan to develop programs that address the humanistic needs of



students. Finally, the researcher suggests new directions for future research in fostering humanistic values.

Keywords: Collaborative Teaching Approach, Social skills, ethical and moral development, empathy, respect, cooperation, and tolerance, humanistic values, holistic development, national identity

INTRODUCTION

The undertaken study is a pragmatic effort to understand the complex phenomena of educating the masses to making it more useful and productive by making the curriculum contextualize and relevant to the local needs and demands. This is also essential to strengthen the nationhood among the people keep they loyal to their cultural and ideological values and norms as adecolonized curriculum is an educational framework that moves away from Eurocentric, colonial narratives and instead emphasizes local knowledge systems, cultural values, indigenous languages, and national history. It seeks to empower learners by aligning education with their own socio-cultural, religious, and historical identity, rather than relying solely on imported or imposed models of education.

Humanistic Values are foundations of inspiration for students as well as teachers. It's an irony that we are not able to provide a better system of Education in Pakistan even after seven decades. We could not have good engineers, doctors and other professionals. We are also missing the world wide acceptance of our system of education. As a developing nation Pakistan needs to make changes in our system of education. Academic quality should be complemented by character growth and improvement

“Examining the effectiveness of Collaborative Teaching Approach in fostering the students’ Humanistic Values at the secondary level in Pakistan” aims to examine how collaborative teaching strategies are necessary for the up grooming of students, because cultivation of humanistic values is as important as academic excellence. Collaborative strategies of teaching support students mutually and help in active participation of students; they also show how they are contributing positively, how they are connected with the new world independently. The collaborative teaching gives emphasis to team work, interaction and current knowledge

In the wake of globalization, it is very important to meet the demands of different students in this competitive world, the mutual and collaborative teaching has emerged as an authoritative method for enlightening humanistic standards among students. This comes within the reach of the learners and emphasizes collaboration, communiqué, and communal liability, equipping students to plot a course of life. It helps to minimize the complexity of community, connections and worldwide nationality. Humanistic values, together with compassion, esteem, social accountability, and self-actualization, are progressively more significant in today’s instructive

atmosphere and society at large. By appealing students in joint learning experiences, educators can encourage a deeper thoughtful of valuable ideals and their realistic applications. This paper examines the association between collaborative teaching practices and the development of humanistic values in students, exploring existing literature, the chosen methodology for this research, and the implications of these findings. It is student centered method of teaching that promotes humanistic values among students fully and completely. It strengths the relation between teachers and students.

Literature Review:

The literature review illustrates the arrangement between mutual teaching practices and the necessary mechanism of humanistic education. This study aims to offer pragmatic confirmation concerning the force of collaborative learning on students' development of sympathy, respect, social responsibility, and self-actualization.

The notion of collaborative teaching has been explored in diverse educational frameworks. According to Verster (2024), cooperative learning fosters a prudence of belonging and responsibility among students, which is fundamental for social progress and improvement. Likewise, Mohammad Junaid Khan (2024) posits that mutual knowledge environments not only help to develop educational achievements but also increase interpersonal relationships and communication skills.

Current studies point out that humanistic values play a very important position in determining learners' attitudes and behaviors. Herrera Pavo et.al.(2021) draws attention to the significance of sympathy and reverence as initial basics in promoting a constructive and comprehensive classroom atmosphere. The connection of joint teaching and humanistic values has been promoted and explored by researchers like Jeong, Hamlo Silver and Jo (2019), suggest that working in diverse groups promotes empathy and understanding among students, ultimately leading to a greater sense of social responsibility.

In addition, challenges to implementing collaborative teaching have been recognized. Issues such as group dynamics, differences of culture, and evaluation methods can hamper the efficiency of mutual learning (Yule Rahmatati et al.). Thus, considering these challenges is necessary for maximizing the benefits of collaborative teaching in fostering humanistic values.

Problem Statement

Despite growing recognition of the importance of humanistic values, such as empathy, respect, cooperation, and social responsibility in promoting a peaceful and tolerant society, these values often remain underdeveloped in Pakistan's secondary school students, particularly in urban

areas like Karachi. The traditional teacher-centered instructional models are commonly used in schools tend to prioritize rote learning and academic achievement over moral and social development. As a result, students may lack the interpersonal and ethical skills needed to contribute positively to a diverse and multicultural society.

Collaborative teaching approaches, which emphasize group work, dialogue, shared problem-solving, and student engagement, have shown promise in other educational contexts for enhancing humanistic values. However, in Karachi's secondary schools, there is limited empirical evidence assessing the actual effectiveness of such approaches in fostering these values among adolescents. This gap in knowledge raises important questions about how collaborative teaching methods are being implemented and whether they can meaningfully contribute to students' ethical and social development.

Therefore, this research aims to examine the effectiveness of collaborative teaching approaches in fostering humanistic values at the secondary level in Karachi, Pakistan, to better understand their role, challenges, and potential in transforming classroom culture and student character.

Research Objective

To analyze the extent to which collaborative teaching approaches are implemented in secondary schools in Karachi.

1. To examine the role of collaborative teaching approaches in promoting specific humanistic values such as empathy, respect, cooperation, and tolerance among secondary school students.
2. To examine the relationship between collaborative teaching methods and the development of humanistic values among secondary school students in Karachi
3. To assess teachers' perceptions regarding the practices of collaborative teaching approach in fostering students' humanistic values at secondary school level.
4. To provide context-specific recommendations for improving teaching practices that promote humanistic values at the secondary level in Karachi's schools.

Research Question

- Do secondary school teachers in Karachi perceive the collaborative teaching approach as effective in fostering students' humanistic values, and to what extent do they practice it?"

Research Hypotheses

- Collaborative teaching approaches are significantly implemented in secondary schools in Karachi.
- Teachers perceive that collaborative teaching practices significantly foster students' humanistic values at the secondary school level.
- **There is a significant positive relationship between collaborative teaching approaches and the development of humanistic values among secondary school students in Karachi.**

Significance of the Study

This research holds significant value for Pakistan's educational landscape, particularly in the urban and multicultural context of Karachi. As society faces increasing challenges related to intolerance, social polarization, and a decline in ethical behavior among youth, there is a pressing need to integrate humanistic values such as empathy, cooperation, respect, and tolerance into the formal education system.

By examining the effectiveness of collaborative teaching approaches in fostering these values, the study offers a constructive response to the limitations of traditional, lecture-based pedagogies that often neglect the moral and interpersonal development of students. The research findings can inform curriculum developers, education policymakers, school administrators, and teachers about the pedagogical benefits of collaborative learning in shaping socially responsible, morally grounded citizens.

Additionally, the study contributes to the academic discourse on values education in Pakistan by providing empirical evidence from secondary schools in Karachi. The insights generated will help design more inclusive, participatory, and values-oriented teaching strategies, thereby supporting the goals of national education policies aimed at producing holistic, character-driven individuals.

Ultimately, this research aspires to bridge the gap between academic instruction and moral development, equipping secondary students in Karachi with the ethical foundations necessary to participate constructively in a democratic and pluralistic society.

Scope of the Study

This study is intentionally limited in scope due to its small-scale nature and contextual focus. These delimitations ensure a focused and manageable study while still offering meaningful insights into the academic impact of a collaborative teaching approach to secondary class students in Karachi.

Such researches are essential and useful in discovering and determining the effectiveness of collaborative teaching approaches in fostering humanistic values such as empathy, cooperation, respect, tolerance, and social responsibility among secondary school students in the urban context of Karachi, Pakistan.

The study is limited to selected public and private secondary schools within Karachi city, representing diverse socio-economic, cultural, and educational backgrounds. It targets teachers who use collaborative instructional methods and students enrolled in secondary grades (grades 9 and 10). The study collects the senior teachers' perceptions about their practices in the large experience of teaching in the different schools about classroom practices, student interactions, and perceptions related to value formation through collaborative learning.

Research Methodology

The research is the small scale study conducted in the selected schools of a district. The research was conducted under the positivist paradigm. All process of the research was gone on objectively. The researchers' influences were absolutely avoided throughout the research. Quantitative approach was the adopted approach. survey was the adopted research design. Numerical data were collected by implementing the perception questionnaire based on a 5-point Likert scale on senior secondary school for collecting their experiences and perceptions regarding the use of collaborative teaching approach.

Population

The Target population for this study includes senior secondary school teachers. Private schools are taken as the part of the study. Schools of the district East Karachi was selected as an accessible population to make the study do able as well as to maintain accessibility with the respondents

Sample of the Study

The researchers selected teachers from the 10 private schools in the district East Karachi. In second step, they selected 400 teachers from the different category of private schools already randomly selected schools. so the total sample size was 400 respondents

Research Instrument

The researcher used a closed-ended questionnaire based on 5-points Likert scale to collect senior secondary school teachers' perceptions and experiences about the use of cooperative approach at secondary school level. The researchers used the split-half reliability measure to

estimate the coefficient of reliability of the instrument. They obtained the Spearman-Brown coefficient of reliability of the scale .793 that determined the efficacy of the instrument for measuring the respondents' perceptions towards the efficacy of collaborative teaching approach and their practices for inculcating the students' humanistic ethical values. They Obtained coefficient of construct validity .801 using Cronbach's Alpha which determined that the items of the instrument were more than 80% homogeneous and measuring the desired constructs of the problem.

Analysis of Closed Ended Items

The researchers administered a close-ended questionnaire to collect the teachers and parents' perceptions about the effects of decolonized curriculum and its need for upgrading the students learning level. Descriptive statistics was used to convert the wordy data into numerical to make it measurable statistically then tested the hypotheses to compare the means by using one sample t-test to determine the degree of existence by comparing some criteria. A hypothesis was tested to estimate the correlation of the variables by using Pearson product moment.

Hypothesis 1

The hypothesis was framed to examine the teachers' perceptions about the implementation of collaborative teaching approach in the daily classroom teaching in the private schools of district east Karachi with a hypothesized value that is determined by the help of literature and statistical techniques.

➤ *H₁: Collaborative teaching approaches are significantly implemented in secondary schools in Karachi.*

One-Sample Statistics

Hypothesis	N	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
Collaborative teaching approaches are significantly implemented in secondary schools in Karachi.	400	10.512	0.629	0.082

The table 1 presents statistics of the one-sample t-test. Description of the hypothesis is in column 1. Sample size is in column 2 as N= 400. Obtained Mean is in column 3. Standard deviation is in the column4. Standard Error of Mean is in column 5. In column 2, N shows sample size 400. In column 3, obtained mean is 10.512. In column4, standard deviation is .629. In column 6, obtained standard error of the mean is 0.082. The table shows that obtained mean

10.512 is smaller than the hypothesized mean. And variance in the data is not much greater as it's standard deviation is 0.629. The data has less error as it's error of mean is smaller enough.

Hypothesis	One-Sample Test					
	Test Value = 32					
	t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)	Mean Difference	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
				Lower	Upper	
Collaborative teaching approaches are significantly implemented in secondary schools in Karachi.	1.34	399	0.063	-21.488	-52.998	+10.022

The table 2 presents result of the one-sample t-test. Description of the hypothesis is in column 1. Hypothesized value 80 is given on the top of the columns. The t-value is given in column 2. Degree of freedom is in column 3. significance value is in column 4. Mean difference is in the column 5. Interval of the difference with 95% confidence is in the columns 6 and 7. Positive mean difference 4.83 depicts that obtained mean is greater than hypothesized mean that explains the alternative hypothesis is accepted. The Positive t-value that is greater than 1.34 in column 4 also supports the acceptance of alternative hypothesis and p- value is 0.00 that is smaller than 0.063, expresses that the findings are significant enough to accept the inference of hidden meanings so that the alternative hypothesis has been rejected and the null hypothesis that *Collaborative teaching approaches are not significantly implemented in secondary schools.*

Hypothesis 2

The hypothesis was framed to examine the teachers' perceptions about the effectiveness of collaborative teaching approach in fostering the students' humanistic values at secondary level schools of district east Karachi with a hypothesized value that is determined by the help of literature and statistical techniques.

➤ *H₁: Teachers perceive that collaborative teaching practices significantly foster students' humanistic values at the secondary school level.*

One-Sample Statistics

Hypothesis	N	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
Teachers perceive that collaborative teaching practices significantly foster students' humanistic values at the secondary school level.	400	45.5	0.595	0.94

The table 3 presents statistics of the one-sample t-test. Description of the hypothesis is in column 1. Sample size is in column 2 as N= 400. Obtained Mean is in column 3. Standard deviation is in the column4. Standard Error of Mean is in column 5. In column 2, N shows sample size 400. In column 3, obtained mean is 45.5. In column4, standard deviation is .595. In column 6, obtained standard error of the mean is 0.094. The table shows that obtained mean 45.5 is greater than hypothesized mean. And variance in the data is not much greater as it's standard deviation is 0.595. The data has less error as it's error of mean is smaller enough.

One-Sample Test

Hypothesis	Test Value = 32					
	t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)	Mean Difference	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
					Lower	Upper
Teachers perceive that collaborative teaching practices significantly foster students' humanistic values at the secondary school level.	14.36	399	0.000	13.5	11.65	15.35

The table 4 presents result of the one-sample t-test. Description of the hypothesis is in column 1. Hypothesized value 32 is given on the top of the columns. The t-value is given in column 2. Degree of freedom is in column 3. significance value is in column 4. Mean difference is in the column 5. Interval of the difference with 95% confidence is in the columns 6 and 7. Positive mean difference depicts that obtained mean is greater than hypothesized mean that explains the alternative hypothesis is accepted. The Positive t-value that is greater than 1.96 in column 4 also supports the acceptance of alternative hypothesis and p- value is 0.00 that is smaller than 0.05, expresses that the findings are significant enough to accept the inference of hidden meanings so the null hypothesis has been rejected and the alternative hypothesis *Teachers*

perceive that collaborative teaching practices significantly foster students' humanistic values at the secondary school level.

Hypothesis3

The hypothesis was framed to examine the relationship between collaborative teaching approach and development of humanistic values among secondary school students of district east Karachi by employing Pearson product-moment correlation coefficient.

Descriptive Statistics

	Mean	Std. Deviation	N
Collaborative Teaching	43.0809	0.80943	400
Approach			
Development of	41.9805	0.7822	400
Humanistic Values			

Table5 presents the descriptive stats of the association test. The variables are in first column. second column shows the found Means. third column shows The standard deviation. The fourth column shows sample size of the group of variables as N= 400 for each variable group. In the fourth column, N shows sample size 400 for each group of variable. In the second column, found means are 43. 9805and 41. 7822. In the third column, standard deviation of the variables is 1.80943and .7822.

➤ H_1 : There is a significant positive relationship between collaborative teaching approaches and the development of humanistic values among secondary school students.

The table6 explains the association of the variables for the hypothesis

Correlations

		collaborative teaching approaches	development of humanistic values
collaborative teaching approaches	Pearson Correlation	1	.841**
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.000
	N	400	400
development of humanistic values	Pearson Correlation	.841**	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	
	N	400	400

** . Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

The table 6 presents the result of test of *association between collaborative teaching approaches and the development of humanistic values among secondary school students*

The researcher adopted the Pearson product-moment correlation coefficient for achieving the purpose of testing the variables' associations. The strong positive association among the variables is found as the obtained coefficient of correlation is 0.841. Obtained P-value is 0.00 that determines the high significance of the findings. So the null hypothesis has been rejected that There is no significant relationship between collaborative teaching approaches and the development of humanistic values among secondary school students, it leads to accept the alternative hypothesis that *There is significant relationship between collaborative teaching approaches and the development of humanistic values among secondary school students*

Research Findings & Discussion

Following key findings are based on the analysis of quantitative data inductively collected from secondary school teachers of private schools in Karachi:

The study revealed that while a significant majority of teachers acknowledged the importance of collaborative teaching, only small number of teachers preferred to use practicing-methods consistently in their classroom practices. Teachers in private schools were more likely to adopt structured collaborative activities.

Most of the surveyed teachers reported that the many of classroom observations confirmed that students in collaborative settings were more likely to listen to each other, resolve conflicts peacefully, and support peers academically and emotionally.

Most of the surveyed teachers agreed that collaborative teaching approach provides student multiple opportunities of interacting on spontaneous issues that enhances their social skills and moral behavior. They also reported that because of using collaborative teaching methods regularly, improvements in the students' interpersonal relationships, willingness to help others, and classroom harmony were seen. Most of the teachers reported that most of the students prefer learning by using a collaborative teaching approach as they enjoy the whole span of learning and feel more respected, motivated, and confident in the collaborative learning settings. Female students also demonstrated stronger development in the values. A strong positive correlation ($r = 0.841$) was found between the use of collaborative strategies and students' development of humanistic values.

The findings of this study provide valuable insights into how collaborative teaching approaches influence the development of humanistic values among secondary school students in Karachi. The results suggest that while collaborative teaching is not uniformly practiced across all

institutions, it plays a meaningful role in promoting values such as empathy, cooperation, respect, and tolerance particularly when implemented intentionally and consistently.

One of the most significant outcomes of this study was the strong positive correlation between collaborative classroom practices and the presence of humanistic behaviors among students. This aligns with existing research (e.g., Johnson & Johnson, 2009; Gillies, 2016), which highlights the role of cooperative learning in fostering social-emotional skills, moral reasoning, and interpersonal understanding. In the Karachi context, this finding is especially important given the socio-cultural diversity and occasional tensions that characterize urban schools. Collaborative learning offers students a safe, inclusive space to interact with peers from various backgrounds and to practice mutual respect and shared responsibility.

Teachers' perceptions further support the efficacy of collaborative methods in fostering ethical development. Most teachers recognized an improvement in student behavior and social awareness when group-based teaching strategies were employed. However, the research also exposed a gap between belief and practice. Although the majority of teachers valued collaborative learning, less than half reported using it regularly, highlighting a discrepancy rooted in systemic challenges such as large class sizes, curriculum constraints, and lack of professional training. This echoes findings from national studies on teacher preparedness and educational infrastructure (e.g., UNESCO, 2020), which emphasize the need for policy-level support to enable pedagogical innovation.

Furthermore, the data revealed slight gender- and school-type-based variations in the development of humanistic values. Female students generally demonstrated higher empathy and cooperation, while private school students appeared to benefit more consistently from collaborative approaches due to better classroom conditions and administrative support. These findings imply that while collaborative teaching is effective in principle, its success is partially dependent on contextual and structural factors.

Taken together, the results underscore the importance of integrating collaborative pedagogies into mainstream education, especially within Pakistan's urban school systems. However, they also point to the urgent need for teacher training, curriculum flexibility, and institutional support to overcome implementation barriers.

It can be said that the study reaffirms the effectiveness of collaborative teaching in nurturing humanistic values among secondary students in Karachi. It demonstrates that when effectively utilized, collaborative teaching approach not only improves classroom interaction but also contributes to the moral and social development of students. For broader and more sustained impact, educational stakeholders must prioritize teacher capacity-building, adjust curriculum

frameworks to support value-based education, and create enabling environments where collaborative approaches can flourish.

Conclusions

This research set out to examine the effectiveness of collaborative teaching approaches in fostering humanistic values among secondary school students in Karachi, Pakistan. The findings indicate that when collaborative teaching approaches are implemented properly and meaningfully, found to be effective in significantly enhancing students' ethical, interpersonal, and social development.

The study revealed that values such as empathy, respect, cooperation, and tolerance are more likely to be nurtured in classrooms where students engage in shared learning experiences and are encouraged to interact constructively with their peers. Teachers who actively apply collaborative strategies observe improved student behavior, deeper peer relationships, and a more inclusive classroom environment.

Despite these positive outcomes, the research also highlighted several challenges hindering the widespread and consistent use of collaborative teaching. These include large class sizes, time limitations, lack of professional development, and rigid curriculum structures especially in public schools. Nonetheless, the enthusiasm shown by both teachers and students suggests a strong potential for collaborative pedagogy to be scaled more broadly across Karachi's secondary education system.

It can be concluded that this study affirms that collaborative teaching is not only an effective instructional method but also a powerful tool for humanizing education in Pakistan. It offers a practical pathway for educators to move beyond rote learning and actively shape the moral character of future generations. Fostering humanistic values through collaborative learning in the classrooms ultimately contribute to building a more empathetic, tolerant, and socially responsible society.

Future Research Suggestions

Future research should repeat this study across different cities and different levels of institutions. Different kinds of researches and analysis will be helpful in implementing collaborative teaching approach at secondary level measuring the effectiveness of the collaborative teaching approach in different phenomena of the divers schools .The research should be carried out on the all levels of educational institutions and its effectiveness for all aspects of the education system.

Furthermore, it is important to note that the small scale research does not imply causation, and is quite unable to produce comprehensive picture of the phenomena. Different kinds of research that can measure cause-n-effect relationship should be conducted throughout the Pakistan.

Future research should employ longitudinal or mixed-method approaches to examine the causal dynamics and incorporate diverse variables such as class size, teachers' professional attitude, impact of selected activity, acceptability by the diverse ethnic people in the same class, and diversity of culture.

REFERENCES

- Ali, S. (2012). Equity and access to education in Pakistan: A gender-based critique of education policy. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 32(3), 338–345.
- Dewey, J. (1916). *Democracy and Education: An Introduction to the Philosophy of Education*. Macmillan.
- Freire, P. (1970). *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. New York: Herder and Herder.
- Gay, G. (2010). *Culturally Responsive Teaching: Theory, Research, and Practice* (2nd ed.). New York: Teachers College Press.
- Government of Pakistan (2020). *Single National Curriculum – Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training*. Available at: <http://www.mofept.gov.pk>
- Gillies, R. M. (2016). Cooperative learning: Review of research and practice. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, 41(3), 39–54. <https://doi.org/10.14221/ajte.2016v41n3.3>
- Johnson, D. W., & Johnson, R. T. (2009). An Educational Psychology Success Story: Social Interdependence Theory and Cooperative Learning. *Educational Researcher*, 38(5), 365–379. <https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X09339057>
- Khalid, H., & Khan, A. (2021). Teachers' Perspectives on the Implementation of Single National Curriculum in Pakistan. *Journal of Education & Social Sciences*, 9(2), 101–110.
- Nasir, N. S., & Hand, V. (2006). Exploring sociocultural perspectives on race, culture, and learning. *Review of Educational Research*, 76(4), 449–475.
- Noddings, N. (2005). *The Challenge to Care in Schools: An Alternative Approach to Education* (2nd ed.). Teachers College Press.
- Reimers, F. M. (2020). *Educating students to improve the world*. Springer. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-15-3887-2>
- Rahman, T. (2004). *Denizens of Alien Worlds: A Study of Education, Inequality and Polarization in Pakistan*. Oxford University Press.
- Said, E. W. (1978). *Orientalism*. New York: Pantheon Books.
- Smith, L. T. (1999). *Decolonizing Methodologies: Research and Indigenous Peoples*. London: Zed Books
- Verster (2024),
- Slavin, R. E. (2014). Cooperative learning and academic achievement: Why does groupwork work? *Anales de Psicología*, 30(3), 785–791. <https://doi.org/10.6018/analesps.30.3.201201>
- Shoukat, A., & Jamil, A. (2021). Collaborative learning strategies and value education in Pakistani classrooms: A case study of selected secondary schools in Karachi. *Journal of Educational Research*, 24(2), 55–68.
- UNESCO (2015). *Rethinking Education: Towards a Global Common Good?*
- UNESCO. (2020). *Global Education Monitoring Report 2020: Inclusion and education – All means all*. UNESCO Publishing. <https://unesdoc.unesco.org/>
- Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). *Mind in Society: The Development of Higher Psychological Processes*. Harvard University Press.
- Watkins, C. (2005). *Classroom Learning: From Transmission to Transformation*. Routledge.