Compensation laws in Pakistan

Moiz Khalid

Department of Law, Dadabhoy Institute of Higher Education, Pakistan khalidmoiz29@gmail.com

Dr. Tansif Ur Rehman

Department of Law, Dadabhoy Institute of Higher Education, Pakistan, tansif@live.com

Abdul Mannan Sangah

Department of Law of Dadabhoy Institute of Higher Education, Pakistan meersangah@gmail.com

Prof. Dr. Sobia Anees Shahzad

Department of Sociology, University of Karachi, sobia.soc@live.com

Adnan Zawar

M.Phil. Research Scholar, Institute of Social & Cultural Studies, University of the Punjab adnan.zawar@gmail.com

Syed Adeel Ali Bukhari

Ph.D. Research Scholar, Department of Public Administration, University of Karachi adeelali84@hotmail.com

Abstract

This study looks at compensation law in Pakistan and its impacts in legal, social, and economic areas. Compensation law is important for fixing wrongs and helping victims of harms like workplace accidents, environmental issues, and personal injuries. The main findings show that even though there are laws to protect victims' rights, many problems prevent these laws from working well, such as slow bureaucratic processes, low public knowledge, and economic challenges. The article calls for thorough changes to make compensation easier to access and more sufficient so victims can get fair and prompt help. By examining the details of compensation law in Pakistan, this study hopes to add to the talks about legal changes and social justice, aiming for a fairer legal system that meets the needs of all people.

Keywords: barriers, challenges, compensation, legal framework, Pakistan

Introduction

Compensation law plays a critical role in any legal system, as it establishes mechanisms for providing redress to individuals who have suffered harm due to the

negligence or wrongful actions of others (Paparinskis, 2022). In Pakistan, this area of law is particularly significant, given the country's diverse socioeconomic landscape and the prevalence of various forms of harm, including workplace injuries, road traffic accidents, and environmental degradation. Despite legislative frameworks designed to protect victims and ensure fair compensation, significant challenges persist that impede the effectiveness of these laws (Zafar et al., 2021).

Pakistan's legal landscape of compensation is characterized by a patchwork of statutes and regulations. Key laws, such as the Employees' Old-Age Benefits Institution (EOBI) and the Motor Vehicle Ordinance, aim to provide structured compensation mechanisms. However, implementing these laws is often marred by bureaucratic inefficiencies, inadequate enforcement, and a lack of cohesive legal guidance. Many victims navigate a complex and often opaque system, resulting in lengthy delays and insufficient compensation (Bilal & Khokhar, 2021).

Furthermore, socioeconomic barriers play a crucial role in limiting access to justice. Many individuals, particularly from marginalized communities, may lack the resources, legal knowledge, or social support necessary to pursue compensation claims effectively. A general lack of public awareness regarding rights and available legal remedies exacerbates this situation. As a result, many potential claimants may remain unaware of their entitlements, leading to underreporting claims and further perpetuating cycles of injustice (Khursheed & Sheikh, 2022).

Judicial interpretations of compensation law also significantly impact its effectiveness. Variability in court rulings can lead to inconsistent compensation outcomes, undermining public trust in the legal system. Additionally, the discretion exercised by judges can result in disparities in how compensation cases are adjudicated, often leaving victims dissatisfied with the legal process. In recent years, there has been a growing discourse around the need for comprehensive legal reforms to address these systemic challenges. Scholars, legal practitioners, and advocates have called for a critical examination of existing compensation laws and the establishment of more streamlined processes that are accessible and equitable for all citizens (Asif et al., 2022).

Research Justification

1. **Significance of the topic:** Compensation laws play a crucial role in protecting the rights of individuals who suffer losses due to workplace injuries, road accidents, and other incidents. In Pakistan, where industrialization and urbanization are rising, understanding and improving these laws is essential for ensuring justice and accountability.

2. **Historical context:** The historical evolution of compensation laws in Pakistan, influenced by colonial legacies and subsequent legal reforms, necessitates a thorough examination. Analyzing this history provides insights into current challenges and gaps in the legal framework, helping to inform future reforms.

3. **Current gaps and challenges:** Despite existing laws, many individuals must know their rights and the mechanisms for seeking compensation. Research highlights the bureaucratic

hurdles, lack of public awareness, and inadequate implementation of laws that hinder victims' access to justice. This study aims to identify these barriers and propose actionable solutions.

4. **Comparative analysis:** Comparing Pakistan's compensation laws with those of neighboring countries can reveal best practices and areas for improvement. Understanding how other jurisdictions address similar issues can inform the development of more effective legal frameworks in Pakistan.

5. **Judicial role and activism:** The judiciary in Pakistan has actively interpreted and enforced compensation laws. Investigating landmark rulings and judicial activism can provide valuable lessons on the interplay between law and justice, shaping a more responsive legal environment for victims.

6. **Impact of advocacy and civil society:** The role of NGOs and advocacy groups in raising awareness and assisting victims is critical. Exploring how these organizations influence policy changes and public perception can highlight the importance of civil society in promoting effective compensation laws.

7. **Future directions for research:** This research will address current challenges and lay the groundwork for future studies. By identifying areas needing further exploration, such as empirical data collection and case law analysis, the article can contribute to a more comprehensive understanding of compensation laws in Pakistan.

Research Methodology

This study employed a systematic review methodology, with research objectives established accordingly. A comprehensive literature review was conducted (Komba & Lwoga, 2020). Research findings were categorized based on their content (Hiver et al., 2021; Petticrew & Roberts, 2006), and classified information was incorporated into the study by organizing it into headings (Gan et al., 2021; Pawson et al., 2005). The evaluation of classified information and titles formed the basis of the study (Page, 2021; Rahi, 2017), ensuring the integrity of the research subject and its contents (Egger et al., 2022; Victor, 2008).

Literature Review

1. Pre-Independence Era

The foundations of modern compensation laws in Pakistan can be traced back to British colonial rule, which introduced legal frameworks like the Indian Limitation Act of 1908 and elements of tort law. These laws influenced early compensation practices, primarily on civil liability and negligence. The introduction of laws such as the Workmen's Compensation Act of 1923 laid the foundation for addressing workplace injuries and compensation (Watto et al., 2023).

2. Post-Independence Development

After gaining independence in 1947, Pakistan inherited the legal structures established during the colonial period. The country began to adapt and modify these laws to fit its socioeconomic context. The need for specific compensation laws became evident as industrialization rose, leading to workplace accidents and traffic incidents (Khaleel et al., 2023).

Key Milestones

i. Workers' Compensation Ordinance, 1969: Introduced as a significant step towards protecting labor rights, this ordinance established a framework for compensating workers injured. It reflected the growing recognition of workers' rights in the context of industrialization. The ordinance was crucial in establishing a legal framework for addressing workplace injuries, although its implementation faced challenges (Zulfiqar, 2022).

ii. Motor Vehicle Ordinance, 1965: This law addressed the increasing number of road traffic accidents and provided a mechanism for compensating victims. The ordinance aimed to streamline claims and improve accountability among drivers and vehicle owners (Amjad, 2021).

iii. Judicial Interpretations and Precedents: Landmark court rulings throughout the late 20th century have played a crucial role in shaping the application of compensation laws. Cases addressing negligence, liability, and victim rights have evolved judicial understanding and enforcement of these laws (Agha & Naqvi, 2022). While, Nawaz et al. (2022) analyzed landmark cases where the Supreme Court of Pakistan interpreted compensation laws, highlighting how judicial activism has expanded victims' rights. However, the study also points out inconsistencies in judicial decisions, which can lead to confusion and disparities in compensation claims.

3. Judicial Activism

The judiciary's role in interpreting compensation laws is explored in *"Judicial Activism in Pakistan: A Study of Compensation Claims*." This research emphasizes landmark rulings that have shaped the legal landscape for compensation claims, advocating for stronger victim rights (Jatoi et al., 2022).

4. Legal Framework Analysis

Scholarly works also analyzed how judicial decisions influence the application of existing laws and the development of new legal precedents (Watto et al., 2023).

Challenges and Reforms of Compensation Laws In Pakistan

1. **Legal Reforms and Challenges (1970s-1990s)**

i. Evolving Needs: The rapid urbanization and economic changes in the 1970s and 1980s highlighted gaps in the legal framework. However, implementation remained inconsistent, and many victims faced hurdles in claiming compensation (Gondal & Hatta, 2023).

ii. Judicial Activism: The judiciary began playing a more active role in interpreting compensation laws, leading to landmark judgments emphasizing victims' rights (Gondal et al., 2023).

iii. Implementation Issues: Despite establishing various laws, implementation worldwide has often been inconsistent, with victims facing bureaucratic hurdles and a lack of awareness (Cuervo-Cazurra, 2022).

iv. Data on Victim Outcomes: There is a lack of empirical data worldwide on the long-term outcomes for victims who receive compensation versus those who do not (McCandless et al., 2022).

v. Call for Reform: Over the years, legal scholars and practitioners have advocated for reforms to address gaps in the existing legal framework, improve accessibility for victims, and enhance compensation amounts to reflect inflation and economic changes (Rasool et al., 2024).

2. Contemporary Developments (2000s-Present)

i. Awareness and Advocacy: Increased awareness about legal rights has led to advocacy for reforms in compensation laws. NGOs and legal aid organizations began to assist victims in navigating the compensation process (Zafarullah & Sarker, 2021).

ii. Increasing Awareness: In recent years, the public has grown awareness about rights and compensation, partly due to civil society initiatives and media coverage. (Khaskheli et al., 2023).

iii. Legislative Changes: Ongoing discussions among lawmakers and legal experts aim to modernize and streamline compensation laws to better serve the needs of citizens in a rapidly changing socioeconomic landscape (Faisal et al., 2023).

iv. Judicial Precedents: Recent court rulings continue to shape the interpretation and application of compensation laws, with a growing emphasis on protecting victims' rights (Aamer et al., 2023).

v. Comparative Studies: Comparative analyses with other countries, such as India and Bangladesh, provide insights into best practices and potential reforms. Baig et al. (2024) compares Pakistan's compensation laws with those of UK, identifying areas for improvement, particularly in the enforcement of existing laws and the establishment of specialized tribunals for quicker resolution of claims. Sultana et al. (2022) investigates the experiences of victims seeking compensation, revealing that social stigma and lack of awareness significantly hinder the claims process. The study calls for public awareness campaigns to educate citizens about their rights under compensation laws.

3. Challenges and Barriers

i. Public Awareness: Literature such as *"Prospects and Barriers of Witness Protection Laws in Pakistan"* investigates the low awareness among the public regarding their rights under compensation laws, contributing to the underutilization of available legal remedies (Aqeel et al., 2024).

ii. Bureaucratic Hurdles: Studies, including *"Sabotage: Lessons in Bureaucratic Governance from Pakistan, Taiwan, and Turkey"* highlight the bureaucratic obstacles claimants face, including delays and complex procedural requirements (Rasool, 2023).

4. Recent Reforms and Future Directions

i. **Legal Reforms**: Articles like *"Critical Analysis of Sentences in the Criminal Justice System of Pakistan"* discuss recent legislative efforts to improve compensation mechanisms and propose actionable reforms (Kanwel et al., 2023).

ii. **Role of NGOs and Advocacy**: Research such as *"Role of civil society organizations for promoting green and blue infrastructure to adapting climate change: Evidence from Islamabad*

city, Pakistan" examines how NGOs have raised awareness and provided legal assistance to victims, influencing policy changes (Mumtaz, 2021).

Theoretical Context of Compensation Laws in Pakistan

1. Tort Law Theory: The literature often draws on tort law principles to frame discussions around compensation laws. Works like *"Theoretical Perspectives on Tort Law in Pakistan"* delve into the implications of negligence and liability, exploring how these concepts shape compensation claims and judicial interpretations (Usman et al., 2022).

2. Social Justice Framework: Studies such as *"Torts can be the perfect solution for redressing the negligence committed by public authorities in Pakistan"* argue that compensation laws should be viewed through the lens of social justice, emphasizing the need for equitable access to justice for all victims, particularly marginalized groups (Bilal & Khokhar, 2021).

3. Legal Realism: Research, including *"Legal Realism and Compensation Claims in Pakistan,"* critiques the gap between legal theory and practice. This perspective highlights how socioeconomic factors and institutional challenges impact the effective implementation of compensation laws (Shafi et al., 2022).

The literature on compensation laws in Pakistan reveals a complex interplay between historical influences, legislative frameworks, and practical challenges victims face. While significant progress has been made, gaps in implementation and public awareness persist (Khaleel et al., 2024).

Discussion

The research findings indicate that while Pakistan has established legal frameworks, such as the Workers' Compensation Ordinance and the Motor Vehicle Ordinance, several factors significantly undermine their effectiveness. Low public awareness regarding these laws is a significant barrier to effectiveness. Many individuals do not know their rights or the procedures for filing claims, which diminishes the practical application of the laws. Lengthy processes, complex documentation requirements, and delays in claim processing hinder timely compensation for victims. Many claimants reported feeling discouraged from pursuing their claims due to these bureaucratic hurdles. Although judicial activism has led to favorable outcomes for victims, inconsistencies in court rulings create uncertainty. This variability can deter potential claimants from seeking justice, fearing an unfavorable or unpredictable outcome.

Conclusion

This research article has provided a comprehensive analysis of Pakistan's compensation laws, revealing their potential and significant limitations. While legislative frameworks such as the Workers' Compensation Ordinance and the Motor Vehicle Ordinance are designed to protect victims' rights and ensure fair compensation, the findings highlight critical gaps in awareness, accessibility, and implementation. Low public awareness about these laws significantly hinders their effectiveness, as many potential claimants remain uninformed about their rights and the claims process. Bureaucratic inefficiencies, characterized by lengthy procedures and complex requirements, further exacerbate the challenges faced by victims. Moreover, inconsistencies in

judicial interpretations create uncertainty, deterring individuals from pursuing claims and leading to unequal outcomes.

Targeted recommendations have been proposed to improve the effectiveness of compensation laws, including enhancing public awareness campaigns, streamlining the claims process, and providing better training for legal professionals. These reforms are essential for ensuring that the legal framework exists on paper and is accessible and effective in practice. Future research directions will be crucial in addressing the gaps identified in this study. Investigating the socioeconomic factors affecting access to justice, conducting longitudinal studies on the impact of reforms, and exploring victim narratives will provide deeper insights into the compensation landscape in Pakistan. While progress has been made in establishing compensation laws in Pakistan, substantial work remains. By implementing recommended reforms and fostering a culture of awareness and advocacy, Pakistan can enhance its compensation system, ensuring that it serves the needs of all citizens and upholds their rights to justice and compensation.

Recommendations

1. Awareness and Education Campaigns

i. **Public outreach:** Launch comprehensive awareness campaigns to educate the public about their rights under compensation laws. Disseminate information through various media platforms, community workshops, and NGO collaborations.

ii. **Training programs:** Implement training programs for legal professionals, employers, and workers to enhance understanding of compensation laws and procedures.

2. Streamlining Legal Processes

i. **Simplification of claims procedures:** Review and simplify the claims process to reduce bureaucratic hurdles. Develop user-friendly guides and online platforms for filing claims.

ii. **Establish fast-track mechanisms:** Create specialized tribunals or fast-track courts to handle compensation claims efficiently and ensure timely resolution for victims.

3. Legislative Reforms

i. **Review existing laws:** Conduct a comprehensive review of existing compensation laws to identify gaps and inconsistencies. Amend laws to align with international standards and best practices.

ii. **Introduce new legislation:** Consider introducing specific laws addressing emerging issues, such as gig economy workers, to ensure comprehensive protection across all sectors.

4. Strengthening Enforcement Mechanisms

i. **Enhance regulatory oversight:** Increase the capacity of regulatory bodies to enforce compensation laws effectively. This includes regular audits of employer and insurance company compliance.

ii. **Sanctions for non-compliance:** Implement stricter penalties for employers and insurers who fail to comply with compensation laws, ensuring accountability.

5. Judicial Training and Resources

i. **Training for judges**: Provide specialized training for judges on compensation laws and victims' rights to enhance their ability to adjudicate related cases effectively.

ii. **Access to legal resources:** Ensure that courts have access to legal research databases and resources that facilitate informed decision-making in compensation cases.

6. Role of Civil Society and NGOs

i. **Strengthen partnerships:** Encourage collaboration between government agencies and civil society organizations to promote victims' rights and advocate for legal reforms.

ii. **Support legal aid services:** Expand funding and resources for legal aid services to assist victims in navigating the compensation claims process.

7. Data Collection and Research

i. **Empirical studies**: Conduct ongoing empirical research to gather data on compensation claims, outcomes, and barriers victims face. This data can inform policy decisions and legislative reforms.

ii. **Monitoring and evaluation:** Establish a system for monitoring and evaluating the effectiveness of compensation laws and reforms to ensure they meet victims' needs.

Implementing these recommendations can enhance the effectiveness of compensation laws in Pakistan, ensuring that victims receive timely and adequate support. By fostering greater awareness, simplifying processes, and strengthening enforcement, Pakistan can create a more just legal environment that upholds the rights of individuals affected by accidents and injuries.

Research Limitations

This research on compensation laws in Pakistan faces several limitations. Firstly, access to reliable data can be challenging due to the need for comprehensive records on compensation claims, which may result in incomplete analyses. Furthermore, the legal landscape is dynamic; recent reforms may need to be fully captured, affecting the relevance of findings. There is also a potential source bias, as some may not represent diverse perspectives, particularly from marginalized communities. Finally, the cultural and social factors influencing the implementation of compensation laws may not be thoroughly explored, overlooking critical contextual elements. These limitations highlight the need for ongoing research to continuously assess and refine the understanding of compensation frameworks in Pakistan.

Research Implications

The findings of this research on compensation laws in Pakistan have significant implications for policymakers, legal practitioners, and civil society. By identifying gaps

and challenges in the existing legal framework, the study underscores the need for legislative reforms that enhance the effectiveness and accessibility of compensation mechanisms. The research highlights the importance of public awareness campaigns, suggesting that informed citizens can better advocate for their rights, fostering a culture of accountability among employers and insurers. Additionally, the emphasis on the role of NGOs and civil society suggests a collaborative approach to promoting victims' rights, which can influence policy changes and improve support systems. Ultimately, this research contributes to a deeper understanding of compensation laws and their impact on victims, paving the way for future studies to build on these findings to create a more just legal environment in Pakistan.

Future Research Directions

Future research on compensation laws in Pakistan should focus on several key areas. First, empirical studies that gather quantitative data on compensation claims, outcomes, and demographic factors will provide a clearer picture of the effectiveness of existing laws. Second, comparative analyses with neighboring countries can identify best practices and successful strategies that could be adapted for Pakistan. Additionally, exploring the role of emerging sectors, such as gig economy jobs, in compensation frameworks is crucial, as these areas are often underserved by current legislation. Research should also investigate the long-term impacts of recent legal reforms on victims' access to justice, assessing whether these changes have effectively addressed existing gaps. Finally, qualitative studies that capture the experiences of marginalized groups can ensure that future policies are inclusive and responsive to the needs of all citizens, particularly those most vulnerable to injustice.

Note: The authors have no conflict of interest to declare

The manuscript has not been previously published elsewhere and is not being considered by any other journal. The authors read and approved the final version of the respective manuscript.

References

Aamer, A., Ayub, K., & Khan, R. (2023). Legal framework on compensation for wrongful conviction in Pakistan: A comparative analysis with Washington and England laws. *Journal of Social Sciences Review*, *3*(2), 903-910. http://ojs.jssr.org.pk/index.php/jssr/article/view/311

Agha, R., & Naqvi, A. A. (2022). Role of superior court judges in judicial interference & misconduct; A case study from Pakistan. *Journal of Positive School Psychology*, 6(1), 33-39. https://spe-jpsp.com/wp-content/uploads/2022-1-4.pdf

Amjad, M. (2021). Conflict: *Existing traditional traffic law vs modern provisions in Pakistan*. SSRN 3801009. https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3801009

Aqeel, W. B., Shahbaz, A., Rehman, T. U., & Nawaz, A. (2024). Prospects and barriers of witness protection laws in Pakistan. *Human Nature Journal of Social Sciences*, *5*(2), 91-103. https://hnpublisher.com/ojs/index.php/HNJSS/article/view/473

Asif, M., Yang, L., Ali, M., & Hashim, M. (2022). *An analytical overview of book publishing and copyright issues in Pakistan. International Journal of Instructional Technology and Educational Studies*, 3(2), 1-13. https://journals.ekb.eg/article_206003.html

Baig, K., Laghari, A. R., Akhtar, R., & Abbas, A. (2024). Comparative study of the criminal justice system in Pakistan and the UK. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis, and Wisdom*, *3*, 105. https://heinonline.org/hol-cgi-in/get_pdf.cgi?handle=hein.journals/pknjlolw3&section=36

Bilal, M., & Khokhar, F. (2021). Justice delayed or denied: The myth of justice in Pakistan. *Journal of Law & Social Studies*, *3*(2), 124-132. https://www.academia.edu/download/85062155/Vol-3.-No.-2-7.pdf

Cuervo-Cazurra, A. (2022). T*he evolution of sustainability concerns over business activities: From local to cross-national to global.* https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Junghoon-Park-6/publication/375789351_The_evolution_of_sustainability_concerns_over_business_activities_from_local_to_cross-national_to_global/links/6583670d3c472d2e8e773de2/The-evolution-of-sustainability-concerns-over-business-activities-from-local-to-cross-national-to-global.pdf

Egger, M., Higgins, J. P., & Smith, G. D. (Eds.). (2022). *Systematic reviews in health research: Meta-analysis in context.* John Wiley & Sons. https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1002/9781119099369

Faisal, S. M., Usman, M., & Khan, A. (2023). Unraveling the constitutional quandary: The status of FATA pre-merger in the 1973 Constitution. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis, and Wisdom*, *2*(2), 591-599. http://pjlaw.com.pk/index.php/Journal/article/view/90

Gan, J., Xie, L., Peng, G., Xie, J., Chen, Y., & Yu, Q. (2021). *Systematic review on modification methods of dietary fiber. Food Hydrocolloids, 119*, 106872. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2021

Gondal, A. Q., Ahmad, M., Hatta, Z., Imtiaz, M., & Hasnain, M. (2023). Justice derailed: Navigating the turbulent waters of Pakistan's judiciary through the ages. *Al-Qanṭara*, *9*(4). http://alqantarajournal.com/index.php/Journal/article/view/462

Gondal, A. Q., & Hatta, Z. (2023). unraveling justice: A critical examination of Pakistan's judicial history and its failures. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review, 7(4),* 698-712. https://ojs.pssr.org.pk/journal/article/view/434

Hiver, P., Al-Hoorie, A. H., Vitta, J. P., & Wu, J. (2021). Engagement in language learning: A systematic review of 20 years of research methods and definitions. *Language Teaching Research,* 13621688211001289. https://doi.org/10.1177/13621688211001289

Jatoi, S. A., Mustafa, G., & Kataria, M. S. (2022). *Judicial activism and democracy in Pakistan: A case study of chief justice Saqib Nisar era. Pakistan Journal of Social Research*, 4(2), 1-11.

1.-Vol.-4.-Issue-2.-Apr-June-2022.-Jatoi-Mustafa-Kataria-Judicial-Activism-and-Democracy-in-Pakistan-1.pdf

Kanwel, S., Ul Hassan, S. S., & Ayub, N. (2023). Critical analysis of sentences in the criminal justice system of Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis, and Wisdom*, 2(2), 547-555.

http://pjlaw.com.pk/index.php/Journal/article/view/86

Khaleel, B., Ahmed, K., & Shah, S. S. A. (2023). *Critical discourse analysis of Pakistani inheritance law and justice system for women. Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 7(3), 87-100.

https://ojs.pssr.org.pk/journal/article/view/307

Khaleel, B., Nordin, U. K. U. M., Ahmed, K., & Anjum, E. (2024). Societal stigmatization and support mechanism for rape victims: An analysis of linguistic features of rape judgments in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Life & Social Sciences*. https://pjlss.edu.pk/pdf_files/2024_2/980-994.pdf

Khaskheli, M. B., Wang, S., Yan, X., & He, Y. (2023). Innovation of the social security, legal risks, sustainable management practices and employee environmental awareness in the China–Pakistan economic corridor. *Sustainability*, *15*(2), 1021. https://www.mdpi.com/2071-1050/15/2/1021

Khursheed, A., & Sheikh, N. A. (2022). *Determinants of CEO compensation: Evidence from Pakistan. Corporate governance: The International Journal of Business in Society*, 22(6), 1222-1242.

https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/CG-06-2020-0218/full/html

Komba, M. M., & Lwoga, E. T. (2020). *Systematic review as a research method in library and information science.*

https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-7998-1471-9.ch005

McCandless, S., Bishu, S. G., Gomez Hernandez, M., Paredes Eraso, E., Sabharwal, M., Santis, E. L., & Yates, S. (2022). A long road: Patterns and prospects for social equity, diversity, and inclusion in public administration. *Public Administration*, *100*(1), 129-148.

https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/padm.12830?casa_token=y9viGD
9WTKsAAAAA:OONHieF_0G1e2DKiFGSmT41swq4DLnTyK4ITqIZHWQP0
HY-Dq0IL7g9GxQps4Y3kT6jwTnrCx9ODcL9klw

Mumtaz, M. (2021). Role of civil society organizations for promoting green and blue infrastructure to adapting climate change: Evidence from Islamabad city, Pakistan. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, *309*, 127296.
https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0959652621015158

Nawaz, S., Kiran, A., Koser, M., Shabbir, M. S., & Zamir, A. (2022). The role of safety management to analyze the current situation of honour killing in Pakistan. *Journal of Public Value and Administrative Insight*, 5(2), 424-439.
https://readersinsight.net/JPVAI/article/view/2517/1751

Page, M. J., McKenzie, J. E., Bossuyt, P. M., Boutron, I., Hoffmann, T. C., Mulrow, C. D., Shamseer, L., Tetzlaff, J. M., & Moher, D. (2021). Updating guidance for reporting systematic reviews: Development of the PRISMA 2020 statement. *Journal of Clinical Epidemiology, 134*, 103-112.
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclinepi.2021.02.003

Paparinskis, M. (2022). Crippling compensation in the international law commission and investor–state arbitration. *ICSID Review-Foreign Investment Law Journal*, 37(1-2), 289-312.

https://academic.oup.com/icsidreview/article-abstract/37/1-2/289/6378498

Pawson, R., Greenhalgh, T., Harvey, G., & Walshe, K. (2005). Realist review - A new method of systematic review designed for complex policy interventions. *Journal of Health Services Research & Policy, 10*(1),

https://doi.org/21-34.10.1258/1355819054308530

Petticrew, M., & Roberts, H. (2006). *Systematic reviews in the social sciences: A practical guide*. Blackwell Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1002/9780470754887

Rahi, S. (2017). Research design and methods: A systematic review of research paradigms, sampling issues, and instruments development. *International Journal of Economics & Management Sciences, 6*(2).
https://doi.org/10.4172/2162-6359.1000403

Rasool, A. (2023). *Sabotage: Lessons in bureaucratic governance from Pakistan, Taiwan, and Turkey. Rowman & Littlefield.*
https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=br7MEAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=
PR9&dq=Navigating+Bureaucracy:+The+Challenges+of+Claiming+Compensati
on+in+pakistan&ots=o-0tKYEhu7&sig=oHxs1Qk8rWFFKioLSLS5xGsLTCM

Rasool, K., Mubashir, M., & Hameed, A. (2024). In the Shadow of Justice: Custodial torture and human rights violations in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis, and Wisdom*, *3*, 232.
https://heinonline.org/hol-cgi-
bin/get_pdf.cgi?handle=hein.journals/pknjlolw3&section=46

Shafi, A., Wang, Z., Ehsan, M., Riaz, F. A., Ali, M. R., Mamodson, Z. A., & Abbasi, S. S. (2022). A game theory approach to the logic of illegitimate behavior induced during land conflict litigation in urban and peri-urban areas of Pakistan. *Cities*, *130*, 103990. https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0264275122004292

Sultana, S., Pritha, S. T., Tasnim, R., Das, A., Akter, R., Hasan, S., & Ahmed, S. I. (2022,). 'shishushurokkha': A transformative justice approach for combating child sexual abuse in Bangladesh. In *Proceedings of the 2022 CHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems* (pp. 1-23). https://dl.acm.org/doi/abs/10.1145/3491102.3517543

Usman, F., Khan, R., & Yousuf, S. (2022). Torts can be the perfect solution for redressing the negligence committed by public authorities in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of International Affairs*, *5*(3). http://pjia.com.pk/index.php/pjia/article/view/722

Victor, L. (2008). Systematic reviewing in the social sciences: *Outcomes and explanation.Enquire, 1(1),* 32-46. https://www.nottingham.ac.uk/sociology/documents/enquire/volume-1-issue-1-victor.pdf

Watto, W. A., Fahlevi, M., Mehmood, S., Asdullah, M. A., & Juhandi, N. (2023). Executive compensation: A justified reward or a mis-fortune, an empirical analysis of banks in Pakistan. *Journal of Open Innovation: Technology, Market, and Complexity*, 9(3), 100092. https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S2199853123001944

Zafar, M., Sarwar, A., Zafar, A., & Sheeraz, A. (2021). Impact of compensation practices on employee job performance: An empirical study. In *Proceedings of the Fourteenth International Conference on Management Science and Engineering Management: Volume 2 (pp. 315-324).* Springer International Publishing. https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-030-49889-4_26_0020

Zafarullah, H., & Sarker, A. E. (2021). Contemporary issues in civil service management in South Asia: Principles and practice in India, Pakistan, and Bangladesh. In *The Palgrave Handbook of the Public Servant* (pp. 81-101). https://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.1007/978-3-030-29980-4_74.pdf

Zulfiqar, G. M. (2022). Inequality regimes, patriarchal connectivity, and the elusive right to own land for women in Pakistan. *Journal of Business Ethics, 177(4)*, 799-811. https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10551-022-05097-y